MSBO FACILITIES BENCHMARKING REPORT

By: Robert L. Moles, Applied Solutions

For eight of the past ten calendar years, MSBO has published this facilities benchmarking report for use by business and facilities managers to compare their costs and practices to the universe of school districts in Michigan. This year's report also includes comparison data from each of the previous reports illustrating effects of changes made over time.

Benchmarking is a process used by many organizations to evaluate their performance by comparing themselves within their industry in a number of categories. Using benchmarking data, internal goals and objectives are set to match the best results in each category. As each segment of the organization is benchmarked, progress toward those goals is measured and the entire organization benefits.

Armed with the information in this report, school administrators can make decisions and offer solutions to the problems faced by Michigan schools, and for their districts in particular. Current uncertainties in school funding make the information in this report more valuable than ever. More than a billion dollars is spent annually by Michigan schools in the area of facilities maintenance and cleaning, and MSBO has consistently provided the information to its members so that decisions can be made about the allocations of those dollars on an informed, data-driven basis. MSBO members have used the information to:

- Obtain additional funding for maintenance.
- Pass building improvement millage and bond issues.
- Evaluate the question of subcontracting.
- Assist in labor negotiations.
- Improve efficiency in building operations.

MSBO has contracted with *Applied Solutions*, a Michigan based independent consulting firm, to carry out the study and publish the results for school years since 1999-2000.

It should be understood that the information contained in this report is strictly *quantitative*, and does not address the *quality* of maintenance and custodial work in schools. These numbers represent a starting point, with measurements common to all districts. As you interpret the data presented, you should focus on the numbers and look for ways to improve on your own numbers, while maintaining or improving the quality of your work.

Subcontracting Information

For the second year, MSBO asked survey respondents to identify whether they contracted "all, or most of their custodial work." Of the 149 districts that responded to the survey, 24 reported subcontracting custodial services, or 16.1 percent of responding districts. In the prior study period 15 districts out of 144 reported subcontracting, a rate of 10.4 percent.

The 24 districts reporting subcontracting custodial work ranged in size from 278 to 8,952 students with a median size of 1,592 students. There were districts located in all six regions that reported subcontracting, with the most in Region 4, "Thumb and Surrounding Area."

In the two measures that are the broadest, three quarters of the districts that reported subcontracting were below the statewide median. In "Maintenance Expenditures as a Percent of Total Expenditures," subcontracting districts' median was 6.50% compared to 7.16% statewide. In "Maintenance Expenditures per Square Foot of Instructional Space," subcontracting districts' median was \$2.93 compared to \$3.82 statewide.

Highlights of This Year's Report

Ten years of information allows some longer-term perspectives on the costs and productivity experienced by Michigan's schools in the area of facilities upkeep. In addition, the recent increase in subcontracting has affected the median performance of all districts.

- "Maintenance Expenditures per Square Foot of Instructional Space" has increased by 11.37% over the course of the past ten years, well below the rate of inflation.
- "Total Building and Grounds Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space" have fallen by 8.33% over the ten years while the "Average Annual Salary has increased by 25.26%.
- "Instructional Square Feet per Total Building and Grounds FTE" has increased by 33.24% in the ten years of study, reflecting a large improvement in productivity.

Key Measures

Each year, a decision is made to select those measurements that will be the most useful to all audiences who will be asked to review and analyze the results, with particular focus on those measures that will be the most useful to Business and Facilities Managers.

The twenty-two *Key Measures* were selected as being the information most useful to business and facilities managers. Those twenty-two key measures are:

- 1. Maintenance expenditures as a percent of total expenditures.
- 2. Maintenance expenditures per square foot of instructional building space.
- 3. Contracted services PLUS total Building and Grounds Salaries per square foot of instructional space.
- 4. Contracted services per square foot.
- 5. Total building and grounds salaries per square foot of instructional space.
- 6. Custodial salaries per square foot of instructional space.
- 7. Skilled Trades/Maintenance salaries per square foot of instructional space.
- 8. Supervisory salaries per square foot of instructional space.
- 9. Clerical/Secretarial salaries per square foot of instructional space.
- 10. Instructional square feet per total Building and Grounds FTE.
- 11. Instructional square feet per Custodial FTE.
- 12. Instructional square feet per Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE.
- 13. Instructional square feet per Supervisory FTE.
- 14. Instructional Square Feet per Clerical/Secretarial FTE.
- 15. Acres per Grounds FTE.
- 16. Total maintenance expenditures per student.
- 17. Utilities per square foot of instructional building space.
- 18. Average annual salary of all Building and Grounds FTE.
- 19. Average annual salary of Custodial FTE.

- 20. Average annual salary of Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE.
- 21. Average annual salary of Supervisory FTE.
- 22. Average annual Salary of Clerical/Secretarial FTE.

The first set of tables, "Eight Years of Year-to-Year Comparisons," shows the median for each of the Key Measures for each of eight years. Each year's median is compared to the prior year as a percent change. This year's median is compared to the first year of the study, and the percent change is calculated. The narrative accompanying each table describes the eight-year change, and the change from last year.

The quantitative information is then presented for the current year by district size ("Tabulation of Key Measures – By District Size"), and in a separate set of tables by region of the state ("Tabulation of Key Measures – Regional Breakdown"). Each table shows the entire range of responses, the ranges for the highest and lowest one third, and the median. The narrative accompanying the tables describes the calculation used, along with recommended use of the information. The narrative describes the results for the all-district information. The regional tables are indicated in blue. The regions are identified by ISD on the page preceding the regional tables.

It must be noted that some ratios fell far beyond any credible range. Where that occurred, an analysis was conducted and the numbers were disregarded as being the result of incorrect information. The range reported reflects the result after eliminating obvious reporting errors.

The Process

In September, a survey document and instructions were sent to all school districts in Michigan. The same documents were made available on the MSBO website. Schools were allowed about three weeks to complete the information and return it to Applied Solutions. 149 districts responded, yielding a sample size of nearly 30%. This large of a sample assures the validity of the information.

The raw data furnished by districts was input into a data matrix and for each of the Key Measures, the median was found by identifying the center of the range of data, above and below which half of the data falls. The *median* is used rather than the *mean* because it is a better indicator than the mean for numbers in a range as wide as those in this study. In addition, the point where the highest and the lowest one third begin is identified.

Definitions

<u>Median</u>: The midpoint in a range of values. That point at which an equal number of school districts fall above and below.

Maintenance Expenditures: The total amount spent in Building Operations, less the cost of utilities. This is the figure whenever the term "Maintenance Expenditures" is used. It is understood that bond issues, sinking funds and other financial devices will impact this number and should be taken into account when evaluating your numbers.

Utilities: The combined cost of gas, electricity, security systems, water and sewer.

<u>Instructional Space</u>: Includes classrooms, corridors, gymnasiums, and swimming pools, along with associated spaces. Does not include garages, maintenance buildings, administration buildings or other buildings not used by students. The square footage of instructional space is the one used for all of the key measurements pertaining to square footage.

<u>FTE</u>: Full time equivalents. The number of individuals in a work category. Where "Total Building and Grounds FTE" is used, it includes grounds personnel, even when the ratio is expressed in square feet of building space. This is because a significant number of districts indicated that groundskeeping was included in the duties of one of the other categories.

<u>Salaries</u>: All payroll dollars, including overtime and paid time off. Does not include the cost of fringe benefits.

<u>Custodial</u>: Those individuals assigned the tasks in building cleanliness, although it is understood that their duties sometimes involve other, non-cleaning tasks.

<u>Skilled Trades/Maintenance</u>: Those individuals assigned to the more technical aspects of building and equipment repair and upkeep.

Supervisory: Those individuals who provide supervision to the maintenance and housekeeping effort.

Clerical/Secretarial: Those who perform strictly administrative tasks for the facilities staff.

Use of the Information

There are seven steps for making the best use of this information:

- 1. <u>Calculate</u> your own school's results by using the calculations described in the tables. Note especially the change in your results from last year to this year.
- 2. <u>Compare</u> your results to the results in all districts, to districts in your peer size group and to districts in your region.
- 3. **Evaluate** areas where you can improve. Unless you know of a legitimate reason otherwise, you should strive to be better than the median or better yet, in the best 1/3.
- 4. <u>Focus</u> your energies on those areas where the most benefit can be realized by calculating the savings that improvements would create.
- 5. <u>Develop Standards</u> for improving your district's results in the target areas. Make sure everyone realizes that other districts in your peer size group and region are achieving your new goals.
- 6. **Develop Processes and Tools** to reach your new standards. Call other districts, query suppliers, consult with experts to find what you can change. Remember, if you keep doing what you're doing now, you'll achieve only the same results.
- 7. <u>Measure</u> your progress as you advance toward your goals. At all levels, *What Gets Measured Gets Done!*

When your target areas have improved to meet your objectives, begin the process over again with the next selected areas for improvement.

Applied Solutions is a Michigan based consulting firm specializing in all aspects of Facilities Management, including planning, implementation, training and documentation.

Contact Information: Robert L. Moles, Managing Principal

Applied Solutions P.O. Box 1165

Jackson, MI 49204-1165 Telephone: 513-509-2677 E-mail: <u>rlmoles@aol.com</u>

EIGHT YEARS OF YEAR-TO-YEAR COMPARISONS

Maintenance and Custodial in Michigan Schools

Number of Districts Responding

			YEAR	TO YEAR COMP	ARISONS		
1999-2000	2000-2001	2001-2002	2002-2003	2003-2004	2004-2005	2006-2007	2008-2009
216	167	217	178	189	143	144	149

1. Maintenance Expenditures as a Percent of Total Expenditures

The amount of General Fund expenses allocated to Maintenance decreased from 2006-2007 levels. This indicates that a somewhat smaller amount of the General Fund expenditures were allocated to facilities upkeep. The percent change in the past ten years has been a negative 8.56%.

				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE
	1999-2000	2000-2001	2001-2002	2002-2003	2003-2004	2004-2005	2006-2007	2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8
Median <i>⇒</i>	7.83%	7.65%	7.57%	7.68%	7.49%	7.60%	7.37%	7.16%	
Percent C	hange 🕏	-2.30%	-1.05%	1.45%	-2.47%	1.47%	-3.03%	-2.85%	-8.56%

2. Maintenance Expenditures per Square Foot of Instructional Space

This very important overall measure of cost increased by 2.41% from the 2006-2007 school year. Over the ten years of the study, the cost has increased 11.37%

study, the co	ot has more	243C4 11.01 /0							
				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE
	1999-2000	2000-2001	2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8					
Median <i>尋</i>	\$ 3.43	\$ \$ 3.47	\$ 3.59	\$ 3.75	\$ 3.57	\$ 3.87	\$ 3.73	\$ 3.82	
Percent C	hange 🕏	1.17%	3.46%	4.46%	-4.80%	8.40%	-3.62%	2.41%	11.37%

3. Contracted Services per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Contracted Services per Square Foot is a measurement begun in the 2002-2003 school year. In 2008-2009 Contracted Services increased by \$.05 per square foot, or 14.71%. Over the six years the information has been collected, the increase is 21.88%.

				YEAR	TO YEAR	СОМЕ	PARISONS							PERCENT CHANGE	
	1999-2000	000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-20													
Median <i>⇒</i>		Not Reported		\$	0.32	\$	0.33	\$	0.32	\$	0.34	\$	0.39		
Percent C	ent Change <i>⇒</i>					3	3.13%	-3	3.03%	6	.25%	14	4.71%	21.88%	

4. Total Building and Grounds Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Salaries per square foot dropped from last year by 3.14%. The reduction over the ten years studied has been \$.14, a decrease of 8.33%.

\sim	7 0.0070.																	
								YEA	R TO YEAR	СОМІ	PARISONS							PERCENT CHANGE
		199	9-2000	2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-2													008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8
	Median 🕏	\$	1.68	\$	1.72	\$	1.64	\$	1.76	\$	1.67	\$	1.72	\$	1.59	\$	1.54	
	Percent C	hang										-	3.14%	-8.33%				

5. Custodial Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Custodial sa	laries	per squ	uare fo	ot incre	easec	l by \$.02	2 fro	m a year	ago	, but rema	ain 3	3.31% bel	ow	1999-200	0.		
		YEAR TO YEAR COMPARISONS															PERCENT CHANGE
	199	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-2009											008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8			
Median <i>尋</i>	\$	1.21	\$	1.22	\$	1.20	\$	1.25	\$	1.20	\$	1.22	\$	1.15	\$	1.17	
Percent C	hang	e <i>⇒</i>	0.0	33%	-1	.64%		4.17%		-4.00%		1.67%		5.74%		1.74%	-3.31%

6. Skilled Trades/Maintenance Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

This catego	ry dro	pped by	8.00%	from I	ast ye	ar, and	l is r	now below	/ 199	99-2000 l	evel	s.					
		YEAR TO YEAR COMPARISONS															PERCENT CHANGE
	199	999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-													08-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8	
Median <i>尋</i>	\$	0.25 \$ 0.28 \$ 0.25 \$ 0.27 \$ 0.24 \$ 0.26 \$ 0.25 \$													\$	0.23	
Percent (Chang	je <i>⇔</i>	12.0	0%	-10.	71%		8.00%		11.11%	8	3.33%	-3	3.85%	Ť	8.00%	-8.00%

7. Supervisory Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

This categor	y continues t	to decline, and	d is now 20.0	0% belo	w the	level	of just f	our y	ears ag).				
J	•	·		YEAR TO	YEAR	СОМРА	RISONS							PERCENT CHANGE
	1999-2000													
Median <i>⇒</i>													0.12	
Percent C	hange 🖈					-6.	67%	7	7.14%	0.0	00%	7	7.69%	-20.00%

8. Clerical/Secretarial Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

This is the fit	th year of ca	pturing this m	easurement	separ	ately, ar	nd it	has rema	ine	d constan	t since 200	2-2	2003 at \$.04	
		, ,					IPARISONS						PERCENT CHANGE
	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-200												YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8
Median <i>⇒</i>											\$ 0.04		
Percent C	hange 🖈						0.00%		0.00%	0.00%		0.00%	0.00%

9. Instructional Square Feet per Total Building and Grounds FTE

This important indicator of productivity has increased steadily over the past ten years, with the biggest gains in the most recent two study periods. The increase since 1999-2000 is now 33.24%.

two study po	nous. The n	ici case siriec	1000 2000 10	110W 33.2470	•									
				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE					
	1999-2000	999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008												
Median <i>⇒</i>	17,033	17,333	17,920	18,162	19,151	19,375	21,358	22,695						
Percent C	hange 🕏	1.76%	3.39%	1.35%	5.45%	1.17%	10.23%	6.26%	33.24%					

10. Instructional Square Feet per Custodial FTE

This measurement has now increased to a level of nearly 30,000 square feet per FTE. This year's increase is 6.18%, and the total over ten years is 27.27%.

total over ter	i years is 21	Z1 /0.												
				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE					
	1999-2000	999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-2												
Median <i>≠</i>	23,303	22,600	23,216	24,036	24,902	25,425	27,933	29,658						
Percent C	hange <i>⇔</i>	-3.02%	2.73%	3.53%	3.60%	2.10%	9.86%	6.18%	27.27%					

11. Instructional Square Feet per Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE

Productivity	increased fro	m last year by	y 13.62%, and	d boosted the	gain over ter	years to 37.	20%.						
				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE				
	1999-2000	2000-2001	2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8									
Median <i>尋</i>	132,000	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008- 132,000 130,673 143,337 146,357 153,416 144,741 159,402 18											
Percent C	Change <i>⇔</i>	-1.01%	9.69%	2.11%	4.82%	-5.65%	10.13%	13.62%	37.20%				

Page 7 of 24

12. Instructional Square Feet per Supervisory FTE

In the five ye	ears this infor	mation has be	een collected	separately, th	ere has been	a 43.73% in	crease.					
			PERCENT CHANGE									
	1999-2000	2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8									
Median <i>≠</i>	➡ Not Reported 360,000 426,095 425,314 479,500 517											
Percent C	hange 🖈				18.36%	-0.18%	12.74%	7.91%	43.73%			

13. Instructional Square Feet per Clerical/Secretarial FTE

In the five ye	ears this infor	mation has b	een collected	separately, th	nere has beer	an increase	of 26.83%.		
				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE
	1999-2000	2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8						
Median <i>⇒</i>		Not Reported	i	690,000	704,734	760,156	817,640	875,146	
Percent C	hange 🕏				2.14%	7.86%	7.56%	7.03%	26.83%

14. Acres, per Grounds FTE

Productivity for this group had remained fairly constant until the previous study period, then posted a sizable increase. This year held steady, and the ten-year increase is 23.19%.

				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE		
	1999-2000	2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-2009									
Median <i>₽</i>	69	72	70	70	65	69	84	85			
Percent C	Percent Change				-7.14%	6.15%	21.74%	1.19%	23.19%		

15. Total Maintenance Expenditures per Student

This year sl	nowed	a smal	decrease	but t	the result o	ver t	ten years	is a	25.64% i	ncre	ase.					
		YEAR TO YEAR COMPARISONS													PERCENT CHANGE	
	199	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-												008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8	
Median <i>尋</i>	\$	\$ 507 \$ 525 \$ 558 \$ 590 \$ 581 \$ 621 \$ 644 \$												637		
Percent (Chang	e <i>≠</i> >	3.55%		6.29%	,	5.73%		-1.53%	6	6.88%	3	3.70%	-	1.09%	25.64%

16. Utilities per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

Please note that reported Utility expenditures decreased from 2003-2004 compared to 2004-2005, but telephone costs were removed in that year. Over the ten years the increase as reported is 38.00%, and would have been greater if the figures were strictly comparable.

							YEA	R TO YEAR	СОМ	PARISONS							PERCENT CHANGE
	1999	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-2009											008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8			
Median <i>≠</i>	\$	\$ 1.00 \$ 1.15 \$ 1.15 \$ 1.22 \$ 1.26 \$ 1.13 \$ 1.36 \$ 1.38									1.38						
Percent C	hange				0	.00%		6.09%	,	3.28%	-1	0.32%	20	0.35%	1	1.47%	38.00%

17. Average Annual Salary of All Building and Grounds FTE

Average	ann	nual	salaries i	ncr	eased by 2	2.98	% over la	ıst y	ear. This	bro	ought the t	en-	year incre	ease	to 25.26	%.		
			YEAR TO YEAR COMPARISONS													PERCENT CHANGE		
		19	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 200												2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8		
Median	Ą	\$	28,840	\$	29,542	\$	30,193	\$	32,065	\$	32,884	\$	33,634	\$	35,081	\$	36,126	
Perce	nt C	han	ge <i>⇔</i>		2.43%	:	2.20%		6.20%		2.55%		2.28%		4.30%		2.98%	25.26%

Page 8 of 24

18. Average Annual Salary of Custodial FTE

The average annual salary of Custodial FTE has steadily increased each of the previous seven years, but declined modestly this past year. The increase over ten years is 23.88%.

tino paot y oc		110 1110100	200	3 TO: 1011 y	ouit	J 10 E0.00	70.										
							YEA	R TO YEAR	CON	//PARISONS							PERCENT CHANGE
	19	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-2												008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8		
Median <i>尋</i>	\$													34,067			
Percent C	hang	ge <i>≠</i> >	:	2.13%	- 4	4.06%		4.19%		3.21%		1.35%	1	0.15%		-2.89%	23.88%

19. Average Annual Salary of Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE

The average annual salary of skilled trades and maintenance FTE increased over last year by 2.89%. The increase since 1999-2000 is 21.38%.

1999-2000 is	s 21.38%.													
				YEAR TO YEAR	COMPARISONS				PERCENT CHANGE					
	1999-2000	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-2009 YEAR 1 TO YEAR												
Median <i>尋</i>	\$ 33,408	\$ 35,315	\$ 34,867	\$ 35,844	\$ 37,017	\$ 38,083	\$ 39,413	\$ 40,552						
Percent C	hange 🖈	5.71%	-1.27%	2.80%	3.27%	2.88%	3.49%	2.89%	21.38%					

20. Average Annual Salary of Supervisory FTE

The change	from last yea	ar was 2.96%,	and the char	nge (over five	year	s is now	17.7	70%.				
	YEAR TO YEAR COMPARISONS PERCENT CHANG												
	1999-2000	2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8										
Median <i>尋</i>													
Percent C	hange 🕏						2.91%		-0.34%	11.47%		2.96%	17.70%

21. Average Annual Salary of Clerical/Secretarial FTE

The increase	e over last ye	ar was 3.32%	s, and 21.86%	ί in t	he past fi	ve y	ears.							
				YEA	R TO YEAR	СОМ	PARISONS							PERCENT CHANGE
	1999-2000 2000-2001 2001-2002 2002-2003 2003-2004 2004-2005 2006-2007 2008-200												2008-2009	YEAR 1 TO YEAR 8
Median <i>≠</i>		Not Reported \$ 30,114 \$ 30,969 \$ 34,166 \$ 35,520 \$ 36												
Percent C	hange 🖈						2.84%	1	10.32%		3.96%		3.32%	21.86%

TABULATION OF KEY MEASURES - BY DISTRICT SIZE

Maintenance and Custodial in Michigan Schools

Number of Districts Responding by Size

			STUDENT COUNT		
	All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than
	Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000
Totals by Student Count	149	19	71	44	15

1. Maintenance Expenditures as a Percent of Total Expenditures

Total Building Operations, less utility costs, were divided by total General Fund Expenditures to determine the amount of emphasis placed on maintenance and custodial. The range is from 4.69% to 11.37%, and the median is 7.16%.

		•		STUDENT COUNT		•
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000
Highort 1/2	From	11.37%	10.83%	10.71%	10.18%	11.37%
Highest 1/3	То	7.63%	6.87%	7.73%	7.64%	7.13%
	From	7.62%	6.86%	7.72%	7.63%	7.12%
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇔</i>	7.16%	6.50%	7.40%	7.18%	6.70%
	То	6.64%	6.25%	6.71%	6.82%	6.46%
Lowest 1/2	From	6.63%	6.24%	6.70%	6.81%	6.45%
Lowest 1/3	То	4.69%	4.85%	4.86%	4.76%	4.69%

2. Maintenance Expenditures per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Maintenance expenditures were divided by total instructional square footage. The range is from \$1.41 to \$7.81, with a median of \$3.82. Comparing your total to other districts of your size is the most important first step in determining if you have opportunities to reduce expenses.

		STUDENT COUNT									
		All	Less	Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than	
		Districts		1000		3000		10000		10000	
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 7.81	\$	5.86	\$	7.81	\$	6.40	\$	6.13	
riignest 1/3	То	\$ 4.17	\$	3.09	\$	4.18	\$	4.09	\$	4.63	
	From	\$ 4.16	\$	3.08	\$	4.17	\$	4.08	\$	4.62	
Mid 1/3	Median <i> </i>	\$ 3.82	\$	2.92	\$	3.77	\$	3.83	\$	4.40	
	То	\$ 3.31	\$	2.73	\$	3.31	\$	3.47	\$	3.83	
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 3.30	\$	2.72	\$	3.30	\$	3.46	\$	3.82	
LOWEST 1/3	То	\$ 1.41	\$	1.41	\$	2.00	\$	1.65	\$	2.64	

3. Contracted Services PLUS Total Building and Grounds Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Contracted Services, combined with Total Salaries per square foot, are a good way to look at the total cost of labor required to maintain and clean your facilities. Some school districts contract all of their building services, so this way of looking at the total is the most useful. The range is from \$.33 to \$4.87 per square foot, with a median of \$2.06.

		STUDENT COUNT								
		All	Less	Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than
		Districts		1000		3000		10000		10000
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 4.87	\$	3.18	\$	4.87	\$	2.93	\$	3.86
riigilest 1/3	То	\$ 2.25	\$	1.78	\$	2.22	\$	2.13	\$	2.69
	From	\$ 2.24	\$	1.77	\$	2.21	\$	2.12	\$	2.68
Mid 1/3	Median <i> </i>	\$ 2.06	\$	1.66	\$	2.07	\$	1.98	\$	2.26
	То	\$ 1.79	\$	1.37	\$	1.85	\$	1.72	\$	2.19
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 1.78	\$	1.36	\$	1.84	\$	1.71	\$	2.18
Lowest 1/3	То	\$ 0.33	\$	0.67	\$	0.94	\$	0.33	\$	1.66

Page 10 of 24

4. Contracted Services per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Contracted Services alone range from \$.01 a square foot to \$2.61 a square foot with a median of \$.39.

4											
		STUDENT COUNT									
		All	Less	Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than	
		Districts		1000		3000		10000		10000	
Highoot 1/2	From	\$ 2.61	\$	2.61	\$	1.86	\$	1.76	\$	0.57	
Highest 1/3	То	\$ 0.54	\$	0.81	\$	0.56	\$	0.59	\$	0.39	
	From	\$ 0.53	\$	0.80	\$	0.55	\$	0.58	\$	0.38	
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇒</i>	\$ 0.39	\$	0.49	\$	0.39	\$	0.41	\$	0.31	
	То	\$ 0.28	\$	0.21	\$	0.31	\$	0.28	\$	0.25	
Lowest 1/2	From	\$ 0.27	\$	0.20	\$	0.30	\$	0.27	\$	0.24	
Lowest 1/3	То	\$ 0.01	\$	0.05	\$	0.02	\$	0.01	\$	0.03	

5. Total Building and Grounds Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

The total of all salaries paid to building and grounds staff was divided by total instructional square footage. The range is from \$.11 to \$3.65, with a median of \$1.54. Each payroll category is further broken down in the tables following. Salaries account for about half of all maintenance costs.

		STUDENT COUNT								
		All	Less	s Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than
		Districts		1000		3000		10000		10000
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 3.65	\$	2.37	\$	3.65	\$	2.43	\$	3.29
riigilest 1/3	То	\$ 1.74	\$	1.33	\$	1.73	\$	1.65	\$	2.30
	From	\$ 1.73	\$	1.32	\$	1.72	\$	1.64	\$	2.29
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇒</i>	\$ 1.54	\$	1.00	\$	1.54	\$	1.54	\$	2.22
	То	\$ 1.32	\$	0.60	\$	1.37	\$	1.33	\$	1.89
Lowest 1/2	From	\$ 1.31	\$	0.59	\$	1.36	\$	1.32	\$	1.88
Lowest 1/3	То	\$ 0.11	\$	0.11	\$	0.12	\$	0.25	\$	1.50

6. Custodial Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Custodial salaries are more than two-thirds of all salaries, and offer the biggest opportunity for gains through improvements. The range is from \$.15 per square foot to \$2.81 per square foot, with a median of \$1.17.

		STUDENT COUNT										
		All	Les	s Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than		
		Districts		1000		3000		10000		10000		
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 2.81	\$	2.01	\$	2.81	\$	1.87	\$	2.52		
riigilest 1/3	То	\$ 1.30	\$	0.77	\$	1.28	\$	1.20	\$	1.57		
	From	\$ 1.29	\$	0.76	\$	1.27	\$	1.19	\$	1.56		
Mid 1/3	Median <i> </i>	\$ 1.17	\$	0.73	\$	1.18	\$	1.12	\$	1.55		
	То	\$ 0.98	\$	0.48	\$	0.98	\$	0.99	\$	1.44		
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.97	\$	0.47	\$	0.97	\$	0.98	\$	1.43		
Lowest 1/3	То	\$ 0.15	\$	0.17	\$	0.51	\$	0.15	\$	1.13		

7. Skilled Trades/Maintenance Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Use this figure to help you decide whether it is more effective to outsource some or all skilled work, or to employ staff to perform this work. The range is from \$.04 per square foot to \$.73 per square foot, the widest of ranges in any salary category, with a median of \$.23. Districts with less than 1000 students reported so few that the results were Not Applicable.

		STUDENT COUNT								
		All	Less Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than	
		Districts	1000		3000		10000		10000	
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 0.73		\$	0.73	\$	0.67	\$	0.49	
riigilest 1/3	То	\$ 0.30	N/A	\$	0.32	\$	0.28	\$	0.38	
	From	\$ 0.29		\$	0.31	\$	0.27	\$	0.37	
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇒</i>	\$ 0.23	N/A	\$	0.23	\$	0.19	\$	0.27	
	То	\$ 0.18		\$	0.18	\$	0.16	\$	0.21	
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.17	N/A	\$	0.17	\$	0.15	\$	0.20	
LOWEST 1/3	То	\$ 0.04		\$	0.05	\$	0.04	\$	0.09	

Page 11 of 24

8. Supervisory Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

The range is from \$.02 per square foot to \$.72 per square foot, with a median of \$.12 per square foot.

		STUDENT COUNT								
		All	Less	Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than
		Districts		1000		3000		10000		10000
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 0.72	\$	0.72	\$	0.32	\$	0.19	\$	0.25
riigilest 1/3	То	\$ 0.15	\$	0.32	\$	0.15	\$	0.11	\$	0.17
	From	\$ 0.14	\$	0.31	\$	0.14	\$	0.10	\$	0.16
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇒</i>	\$ 0.12	\$	0.16	\$	0.13	\$	0.09	\$	0.15
	То	\$ 0.10	\$	0.14	\$	0.11	\$	0.08	\$	0.12
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.09	\$	0.13	\$	0.10	\$	0.07	\$	0.11
LOWEST 1/3	То	\$ 0.02	\$	0.04	\$	0.02	\$	0.04	\$	0.06

9. Clerical/Secretarial Salaries per Square Foot Of Instructional Building Space

The range is from \$.01 per square foot to \$.12 per square foot, with a median of \$.04 per square foot. In districts with fewer than 1000 students, there were so few districts reporting in this category the results were Not Applicable.

		STUDENT COUNT								
		All	Less Than		1000 to		3001 to	More	than	
		Districts	1000		3000		10000		10000	
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 0.12		\$	0.09	\$	0.12	\$	0.08	
riigilest 1/3	То	\$ 0.05	N/A	\$	0.06	\$	0.05	\$	0.06	
	From	\$ 0.04		\$	0.05	\$	0.04	\$	0.05	
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇒</i>	\$ 0.04	N/A	\$	0.05	\$	0.04	\$	0.04	
	То	\$ 0.03		\$	0.03	\$	0.03	\$	0.03	
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.02	N/A	\$	0.02	\$	0.02	\$	0.02	
Lowest 1/3	То	\$ 0.01		\$	0.01	\$	0.01	\$	0.01	

10. Instructional Square Feet per Total Building and Grounds FTE

This is the most important planning and scheduling tool. Begin with the total of all categories, then go to each category to identify the opportunities. Total instructional square feet was divided by total FTEs. The range is from 12,564 to 278,400, with a median of 22,695.

				STUDENT COUNT		
		All Districts	Less Than 1000	1000 to 3000	3001 to 10000	More than 10000
High oot 1/2	From	278,400	231,683	278,400	185,732	26,442
Highest 1/3	То	25,968	37,067	23,689	26,762	21,046
	From	25,967	37,066	23,688	26,761	21,045
Mid 1/3	Median <i> </i>	22,695	29,690	22,035	24,399	20,758
	То	20,998	22,987	20,215	22,515	18,849
Lowest 1/3	From	20,997	22,986	20,214	22,514	18,848
Lowest 1/3	То	12,564	13,627	12,564	16,414	13,269

11. Instructional Square Feet per Custodial FTE

Custodial staff is the largest number of FTEs, and in some districts is the only categorization of building and grounds staff. Setting square footage goals for this group is the most effective way to improve overall performance. The range is from 15,331 to 456,605, with a median of 29,658.

•					•	
				STUDENT COUNT		
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000
Highest 1/3	From	456,605	111,200	49,268	456,605	32,022
riigiiest i/3	То	32,753	42,118	31,676	33,747	27,879
	From	32,752	42,117	31,675	33,746	27,878
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇒</i>	29,658	37,953	28,210	31,428	27,294
	То	27,049	31,500	26,201	28,477	24,105
Lowest 1/3	From	27,048	31,499	26,200	28,476	24,104
LOWEST 1/3	То	15,331	15,331	15,862	21,658	16,281

Page 12 of 24

12. Instructional Square Feet per Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE

There is a wide range of results here, since school districts outsource parts of this work, and some districts have no one in this category. The range is from 65,283 to 1,090,796 with a median of 181,108 square feet per FTE. District with less than 1000 students reported so few that their results were Not Applicable.

				STUDENT COUNT		
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000
Highest 1/3	From	1,090,796		622,824	1,090,796	593,629
riigilest 1/3	То	234,142	N/A	217,210	256,201	226,266
	From	234,141		217,209	256,200	226,265
Mid 1/3	Median <i>≠</i>	181,108	N/A	161,641	230,685	187,220
	То	133,889		121,250	129,950	149,434
Lowest 1/3	From	133,888	N/A	121,249	129,949	149,433
LOWEST 1/3	То	65,283		65,283	68,001	94,662

13. Instructional Square Feet per Supervisory FTE

The range in this category is from 151,057 to 1,880,000, with a median of 517,430 square feet per FTE.										
				STUDENT COUNT						
		All	Less Than	1000 to		More than				
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000				
Highest 1/3	From	1,880,000	930,000	1,880,000	1,687,765	1,304,913				
riigilest 1/3	То	675,211	337,394	502,924	891,933	793,668				
	From	675,210	337,393	502,923	891,932	793,667				
Mid 1/3	Median <i>≠</i>	517,430	236,000	409,800	739,525	597,263				
	То	404,500	153,307	330,200	643,089	517,430				
Lowest 1/3	From	404,499	153,306	330,199	643,088	517,429				
	То	151,057	151,057	185,495	323,584	316,773				

14. Instructional Square Feet per Clerical/Secretarial FTE

Again, a wide range of experience. The range is from 315,364 square feet per FTE to 2,628,552 square feet per FTE, with a median of 875,146. Districts with less than 1000 students reported so few in this category that their results were Not Applicable.

				STUDENT COUNT		
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000
Highest 1/3	From	2,628,552		2,263,230	2,628,552	2,609,825
riigiiest 1/3	То	1,097,229	N/A	868,840	1,153,424	1,190,502
	From	1,097,228		868,839	1,153,423	1,190,501
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇒</i>	875,146	N/A	628,655	941,781	870,444
	То	654,000		499,000	856,800	717,285
Lowest 1/3	From	653,999	N/A	498,999	856,799	717,284
	То	315,364		315,364	358,122	576,172

15. Acres per Grounds FTE

The total acres under maintenance was divided by the number of FTEs assigned to "Grounds." Fewer than half of all districts had a separate category for this work, and districts with less than 1000 students reported so few in this category, the results were Not Applicable. The range was from 10 acres to 390 acres, with a median of 85 acres.

			STUDENT COUNT				
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than	
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000	
Highest 1/3	From	390		390	359	200	
riigilest 1/5	То	117	N/A	105	128	100	
	From	116		104	127	99	
Mid 1/3	Median <i>尋</i>	85	N/A	80	107	71	
	То	60		50	87	54	
Lowest 1/2	From	59	N/A	49	86	53	
Lowest 1/3	То	10		17	10	26	

Page 13 of 24

16. Total Maintenance Expenditures per Student

The number of students has an impact on maintenance expenditures. Maintenance expenditures were divided by the total number of students. The range of maintenance spending per student was \$426 to \$1,116, with a median of \$637.

		STUDENT COUNT							
		All	Less	s Than		1000 to	3001 to	More	e than
		Districts		1000		3000	10000		10000
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 1,116	\$	900	\$	1,116	\$ 997	\$	1,023
riigilest 1/3	То	\$ 681	\$	672	\$	681	\$ 707	\$	695
	From	\$ 680	\$	671	\$	680	\$ 706	\$	694
Mid 1/3	Median <i> </i>	\$ 637	\$	610	\$	630	\$ 657	\$	681
	То	\$ 599	\$	517	\$	580	\$ 634	\$	624
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 598	\$	516	\$	579	\$ 633	\$	623
	То	\$ 426	\$	434	\$	426	\$ 466	\$	496

17. Utilities per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

Although less controllable than labor costs, utilities still represent an opportunity for reducing expenses. Total utilities expenditure ranged from \$.60 per square foot to \$2.25 per square foot, with a median of \$1.38 per square foot.

		STUDENT COUNT								
		All	Less	Than	1000 to			3001 to	More	than
		Districts		1000		3000		10000		10000
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 2.25	\$	1.80	\$	2.25	\$	2.18	\$	2.16
	То	\$ 1.52	\$	1.38	\$	1.47	\$	1.52	\$	1.78
	From	\$ 1.51	\$	1.37	\$	1.46	\$	1.51	\$	1.77
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇔</i>	\$ 1.38	\$	1.33	\$	1.37	\$	1.38	\$	1.64
	То	\$ 1.30	\$	1.18	\$	1.27	\$	1.30	\$	1.48
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 1.29	\$	1.17	\$	1.26	\$	1.29	\$	1.47
	То	\$ 0.60	\$	0.65	\$	0.97	\$	0.60	\$	1.18

18. Average Annual Salary of All Building and Grounds FTE

Total salaries paid annually were divided by total FTEs in Building and Grounds. The result for the total, and for the subcategories below, is the average annual salary per FTE. The range is from \$18,585 to \$69,163, with a median of \$36,126.

		STUDENT COUNT					
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than	
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000	
Highest 1/3	From	\$69,163	\$38,000	\$69,163	\$59,350	\$51,338	
riighest 1/3	То	\$38,449	\$31,910	\$36,424	\$40,384	\$45,724	
	From	\$38,448	\$31,909	\$36,423	\$40,383	\$45,723	
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇔</i>	\$36,126	\$31,672	\$35,014	\$37,866	\$43,286	
	То	\$33,444	\$29,790	\$32,901	\$36,624	\$39,633	
Lowest 1/2	From	\$33,443	\$29,789	\$32,900	\$36,623	\$39,632	
Lowest 1/3	То	\$18,585	\$18,585	\$23,656	\$26,108	\$35,674	

19. Average Annual Salary of Custodial FTE

The range of annual salaries per Custodial FTE is from \$16,150 to \$69,952, with a median of \$34,067 STUDENT COUNT ΑII Less Than 1000 to 3001 to More than **Districts** 1000 3000 10000 10000 \$32,714 \$67,480 \$69,952 \$46,556 From \$69,952 Highest 1/3 \$28,762 \$34,875 \$37,557 \$41,296 То \$36,685 From \$36,684 \$28,761 \$34,874 \$37,556 \$41,295 Mid 1/3 Median \Rightarrow \$34,067 \$27,768 \$32,449 \$36,279 \$40,952 То \$31,067 \$26,978 \$30,386 \$34,133 \$35,785 \$35,784 From \$31,066 \$26,977 \$30,385 \$34,132 Lowest 1/3 \$22,027 \$33,328 То \$16,150 \$16,150 \$27,111

Page 14 of 24

20. Average Annual Salary of Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE

The range in this category is from \$21,390 to \$79,357, with a median of \$40,552. Districts with less than 1000 students reported so few in this category, the results were Not Applicable.

		STUDENT COUNT				
		All Districts	Less Than 1000	1000 to 3000	3001 to 10000	More than 10000
	From		1000	\$79,357	\$66,537	\$71,420
Highest 1/3	To	\$42,585	N/A	\$42,344	\$44,214	\$56,858
	From	\$42,584		\$4,343	\$44,213	\$56,857
Mid 1/3	Median <i>≠</i>	\$40,552	N/A	\$39,468	\$42,044	\$54,081
	То	\$38,509		\$37,701	\$40,076	\$49,041
L avva at 4/0	From	\$38,508	N/A	\$37,700	\$40,075	\$49,040
Lowest 1/3	То	\$21,390		\$25,000	\$21,390	\$39,783

21. Average Annual Salary of Supervisory FTE

The range in this category is from \$30,974 to \$111,345, with a median of \$63,120.

			STUDENT COUNT					
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than		
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000		
Highest 1/3	From	\$111,345	\$64,782	\$96,593	\$92,006	\$111,345		
	То	\$70,054	\$48,709	\$60,767	\$77,131	\$95,771		
	From	\$70,053	\$48,708	\$60,766	\$77,130	\$95,770		
Mid 1/3	Median <i> </i>	\$63,120	\$40,204	\$52,520	\$72,010	\$89,404		
	То	\$53,613	\$39,612	\$48,366	\$69,528	\$79,019		
Lowest 1/3	From	\$53,612	\$39,611	\$48,365	\$69,527	\$79,018		
	То	\$30,974	\$34,668	\$30,974	\$51,190	\$62,938		

22. Average Annual Salary of Clerical/Secretarial FTE

The range in this category is from \$14,798 to \$63,040, with a median of \$36,698. Districts with less than 1000 students reported so few in this category that their results were Not Applicable.

		STUDENT COUNT				
		All	Less Than	1000 to	3001 to	More than
		Districts	1000	3000	10000	10000
Highest 1/3	From	\$63,040		\$63,040	\$50,270	\$51,442
riigilest 1/3	То	\$39,036	N/A	\$36,000	\$38,874	\$43,430
	From	\$39,035		\$35,999	\$38,873	\$43,429
Mid 1/3	Median <i>⇔</i>	\$36,698	N/A	\$31,491	\$37,360	\$42,870
	То	\$33,462		\$29,670	\$33,648	\$36,698
Lowest 1/3	From	\$33,461	N/A	\$29,669	\$33,647	\$36,697
	То	\$14,798		\$18,510	\$14,798	\$25,234

REGIONAL COMPILATION OF KEY MEASUREMENTS

The following 6 pages report on the twenty-two key measures, broken down into regions of the state. These pages are blue to distinguish them from the size breakdown reported previously.

Regions were designated as Region 1 – Upper Peninsula; Region 2 – Northern Lower Peninsula; Region 3 – Western; Region 4 – Thumb and surrounding area; Region 5 – South Central; and Region 6 Southeast.

Intermediate School Districts were used to identify regions. Locate your ISD in the list below to determine your region:

Region 1	Region 3 (cont.)
Copper Country ISD	Muskegon Area ISD
Delta-Schoolcraft ISD	Ottawa Area ISD
Dickinson-Iron ISD	St. Joseph ISD
Eastern Upper Peninsula ISD	Van Buren ISD
Carabia Ontanagan ICD	

Region 4
Bay-Arenac ISD
Genesee ISD

Region 2	Gratiot-Isabella ISD
Alpena-Montmorency-Alcona ESD	Huron ISD
Charlevoix-Emmet ISD	Lapeer ISD
Clare-Gladwin RESD	Midland ISD
Coor ISD	Saginaw ISD
COP ISD	Sanilac ISD
Iosco RESA	Shiawassee RESD
Manistee ISD	St. Clair ISD
Mason-Lake ISD	Tuscola ISD

Newaygo ISD	Region 5
Oceana ISD	Branch ISD
Traverse Bay Area ISD	Calhoun ISD
Wexford-Missaukee ISD	Clinton ISD
	Eaton ISD

Mecosta-Osceola ISD

	Laton 15D
Region 3	Hillsdale ISD
Allegan County ISD	Ingham ISD
Barry ISD	Jackson ISD
Berrien ISD	Lenawee ISD
Ionia County ISD	Livingston ESA
Kalamazoo RESA	Monroe ISD
Kent ISD	

Kent ISD	
Lewis Cass ISD	Region 6
Montcalm Area ISD	Macomb ISD
	Oakland ISD
	Washtenaw ISD
	Wayne RESA

TABULATION OF KEY MEASURES - BY REGION

Maintenance and Custodial in Michigan Schools

Key to regional designations: Region 1 - Upper Peninsula; Region 2 - Northern Lower Peninsula; Region 3 - Western; Region 4 - Thumb and surrounding area; Region 5 - South Central; Region 6 - Southeast

Number of Districts Responding by Region

	All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
	Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Totals by Region	149	8	20	37	31	23	30

1. Maintenance Expenditures as a Percent of Total Expenditures

Total Building Operations, less utility costs, were divided by total General Fund Expenditures to determine the amount of emphasis placed on maintenance and custodial. The range is from 4.69% to 11.37%, and the median is 7.16%.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	11.37%	7.38%	10.71%	8.86%	10.18%	10.83%	11.37%
Hignest 1/3	To	7.63%	6.98%	7.63%	7.85%	7.65%	7.62%	7.95%
	From	7.62%	6.97%	7.62%	7.84%	7.64%	7.61%	7.94%
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	7.16%	6.24%	7.11%	6.94%	7.17%	7.17%	7.52%
	To	6.64%	6.20%	6.80%	6.51%	6.34%	6.50%	7.05%
Lowest 1/2	From	6.63%	6.19%	6.79%	6.50%	6.33%	6.49%	7.04%
Lowest 1/3	To	4.69%	4.85%	6.05%	4.86%	4.99%	4.69%	5.81%

2. Maintenance Expenditures per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Maintenance expenditures were divided by total instructional square footage. The range is from \$1.41 to \$7.81, with a median of \$3.82. Comparing your total to other districts of your size is the most important first step in determining if you have opportunities to reduce expenses.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 7.81	\$ 3.76	\$ 6.26	\$ 5.18	\$ 5.50	\$ 6.40	\$ 7.81
riighest 1/3	То	\$ 4.17	\$ 2.92	\$ 3.97	\$ 3.93	\$ 4.07	\$ 4.07	\$ 4.72
	From	\$ 4.16	\$ 2.91	\$ 3.96	\$ 3.92	\$ 4.06	\$ 4.06	\$ 4.71
Mid 1/3	Median 👄	\$ 3.82	\$ 2.73	\$ 3.64	\$ 3.33	\$ 3.82	\$ 3.36	\$ 4.42
	То	\$ 3.31	\$ 2.67	\$ 3.56	\$ 3.13	\$ 3.16	\$ 3.08	\$ 3.99
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 3.30	\$ 2.66	\$ 3.55	\$ 3.12	\$ 3.15	\$ 3.07	\$ 3.98
	То	\$ 1.41	\$ 1.41	\$ 2.65	\$ 2.00	\$ 2.41	\$ 2.32	\$ 2.53

3. Contracted Services PLUS Total Building and Grounds Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Contracted Services, combined with Total Salaries per square foot, are a good way to look at the total cost of labor required to maintain and clean your facilities. Some school districts contract all of their building services, so this way of looking at the total is the most useful. The range is from \$.33 to \$4.87 per square foot, with a median of \$2.06.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 4.89	\$ 1.85	\$ 3.52	\$ 4.89	\$ 2.97	\$ 3.18	\$ 4.13
riigilest 1/3	To	\$ 2.25	\$ 1.43	\$ 2.15	\$ 2.19	\$ 2.21	\$ 2.15	\$ 2.65
	From	\$ 2.24	\$ 1.42	\$ 2.14	\$ 2.18	\$ 2.20	\$ 2.14	\$ 2.64
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$ 2.06	\$ 1.26	\$ 2.04	\$ 2.00	\$ 2.07	\$ 1.88	\$ 2.26
	To	\$ 1.79	\$ 1.15	\$ 1.79	\$ 1.67	\$ 1.87	\$ 1.58	\$ 2.13
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 1.78	\$ 1.14	\$ 1.78	\$ 1.66	\$ 1.86	\$ 1.57	\$ 2.12
	То	\$ 0.33	\$ 0.67	\$ 1.09	\$ 0.33	\$ 1.34	\$ 0.86	\$ 0.37

Page 17 of 24

4. Contracted Services per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Contracted S	Services alone r	ang	e from \$.01 a	squ	are foot to \$	2.61	a square fo	ot w	ith a median	of \$	i.39.		
			All		Region		Region		Region		Region	Region	Region
			Regions		1		2		3		4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$	2.61	\$	1.03	\$	1.77	\$	1.59	\$	1.97	\$ 2.61	\$ 1.76
riigilest 1/3	To	\$	0.54	\$	0.35	\$	0.62	\$	0.59	\$	0.56	\$ 0.38	\$ 0.39
	From	\$	0.53	\$	0.34	\$	0.61	\$	0.58	\$	0.55	\$ 0.37	\$ 0.38
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$	0.39	\$	0.28	\$	0.54	\$	0.44	\$	0.45	\$ 0.36	\$ 0.30
	To	\$	0.28	\$	0.21	\$	0.45	\$	0.33	\$	0.36	\$ 0.20	\$ 0.25
Lowest 1/3	From	\$	0.27	\$	0.20	\$	0.44	\$	0.32	\$	0.35	\$ 0.19	\$ 0.24
LOWEST 1/3	To	\$	0.01	\$	0.05	\$	0.05	\$	0.01	\$	0.07	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.03

5. Total Building and Grounds Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

The total of all salaries paid to building and grounds staff was divided by total instructional square footage. The range is from \$.11 to \$3.65, with a median of \$1.54. Each payroll category is further broken down in the tables following. Salaries account for about half of all maintenance costs.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 3.65	\$ 1.56	\$ 2.99	\$ 3.65	\$ 2.41	\$ 2.39	\$ 3.58
riighest 1/3	To	\$ 1.74	\$ 1.01	\$ 1.55	\$ 1.64	\$ 1.70	\$ 1.74	\$ 2.30
	From	\$ 1.73	\$ 1.00	\$ 1.54	\$ 1.63	\$ 1.69	\$ 1.73	\$ 2.29
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$ 1.54	\$ 0.98	\$ 1.32	\$ 1.53	\$ 1.60	\$ 1.33	\$ 1.90
	To	\$ 1.32	\$ 0.63	\$ 1.21	\$ 1.37	\$ 1.37	\$ 1.19	\$ 1.76
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 1.31	\$ 0.62	\$ 1.20	\$ 1.36	\$ 1.36	\$ 1.18	\$ 1.75
	То	\$ 0.11	\$ 0.60	\$ 0.89	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.11	\$ 0.27	\$ 1.04

6. Custodial Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Space

Custodial salaries are more than two-thirds of all salaries, and offer the biggest opportunity for gains through improvements. The range is from \$.15 per square foot to \$2.81 per square foot, with a median of \$1.17.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 2.81	\$ 1.15	\$ 2.15	\$ 2.81	\$ 1.75	\$ 2.01	\$ 2.77
riigilest 1/3	To	\$ 1.30	\$ 0.69	\$ 1.18	\$ 1.18	\$ 1.25	\$ 1.35	\$ 1.58
	From	\$ 1.29	\$ 0.68	\$ 1.17	\$ 1.17	\$ 1.24	\$ 1.34	\$ 1.57
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$ 1.17	\$ 0.48	\$ 0.84	\$ 1.03	\$ 1.19	\$ 1.13	\$ 1.49
	To	\$ 0.98	\$ 0.46	\$ 0.79	\$ 0.82	\$ 1.09	\$ 0.89	\$ 1.35
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.97	\$ 0.45	\$ 0.78	\$ 0.81	\$ 1.08	\$ 88.0	\$ 1.34
	То	\$ 0.15	\$ 0.33	\$ 0.17	\$ 0.68	\$ 0.48	\$ 0.65	\$ 0.15

Page 18 of 24

7. Skilled Trades/Maintenance Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

Use this figure to help you decide whether it is more effective to outsource some or all skilled work, or to employ staff to perform this work. The range is from \$.04 per square foot to \$.73 per square foot, the widest of ranges in any salary category, with a median of \$.23. Districts in Region 1 reported so few that the results were Not Applicable.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 0.73		\$ 0.63	\$ 0.73	\$ 0.56	\$ 0.45	\$ 0.67
Tilgriest 1/3	To	\$ 0.30	N/A	\$ 0.29	\$ 0.31	\$ 0.31	\$ 0.20	\$ 0.36
	From	\$ 0.29		\$ 0.28	\$ 0.30	\$ 0.30	\$ 0.19	\$ 0.35
Mid 1/3	Median 👄	\$ 0.23	N/A	\$ 0.27	\$ 0.18	\$ 0.26	\$ 0.18	\$ 0.25
	To	\$ 0.18		\$ 0.20	\$ 0.17	\$ 0.21	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.19
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.17	N/A	\$ 0.19	\$ 0.16	\$ 0.20	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.18
	То	\$ 0.04		\$ 0.08	\$ 0.07	\$ 0.08	\$ 0.05	\$ 0.04

8. Supervisory Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

The range is from \$.02 per square foot to \$.72 per square foot, with a median of \$.12 per square foot.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 0.72	\$ 0.36	\$ 0.72	\$ 0.25	\$ 0.37	\$ 0.33	\$ 0.25
riighest 1/3	То	\$ 0.15	\$ 0.14	\$ 0.16	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.17	\$ 0.14	\$ 0.14
	From	\$ 0.14	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.15	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.16	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.13
Mid 1/3	Median 🥏	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.15	\$ 0.11	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.11
	To	\$ 0.10	\$ 0.04	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.10	\$ 0.11	\$ 0.10	\$ 0.10
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.09	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.11	\$ 0.09	\$ 0.10	\$ 0.09	\$ 0.09
LUWEST 1/3	To	\$ 0.02	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.05	\$ 0.02	\$ 0.04	\$ 0.04	\$ 0.05

9. Clerical/Secretarial Salaries per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

The range is from \$.01 per square foot to \$.12 per square foot, with a median of \$.04 per square foot. In Region 1 and Region 2, there were so few districts reporting in this category the results were Not Applicable.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 0.12			\$ 0.08	\$ 0.09	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.08
riighest 1/5	То	\$ 0.05	N/A	N/A	\$ 0.06	\$ 0.05	\$ 0.04	\$ 0.06
	From	\$ 0.04			\$ 0.05	\$ 0.04	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.05
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$ 0.04	N/A	N/A	\$ 0.04	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.05
	To	\$ 0.03			\$ 0.03	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.03	\$ 0.04
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 0.02	N/A	N/A	\$ 0.02	\$ 0.02	\$ 0.02	\$ 0.03
LOWEST 1/3	То	\$ 0.01			\$ 0.01	\$ 0.02	\$ 0.02	\$ 0.02

Page 19 of 24

10. Instructional Square Feet per Total Building and Grounds FTE

This is the most important planning and scheduling tool. Begin with the total of all categories, then go to each category to identify the opportunities. Total instructional square feet was divided by total FTEs. The range is from 12,564 to 278,400, with a median of 22,695.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	278,400	51,667	37,867	278,400	231,683	185,732	52,183
riighest 1/5	To	25,968	46,202	27,656	25,200	24,399	28,680	23,208
	From	25,967	46,201	27,655	25,199	24,398	28,679	23,207
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	22,695	31,758	22,297	23,133	22,127	26,555	21,231
	To	20,998	29,500	20,998	22,248	19,710	20,913	20,533
Lowest 1/3	From	20,997	29,499	20,997	22,247	19,709	20,912	20,532
LOWEST 1/3	To	12,564	18,952	16,068	16,414	13,219	13,627	12,564

11. Instructional Square Feet per Custodial FTE

Custodial staff is the largest number of FTEs, and in some districts is the only categorization of building and grounds staff. Setting square footage goals for this group is the most effective way to improve overall performance. The range is from 15,331 to 456,605, with a median of 29,658.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	456,605	81,200	111,200	47,754	78,396	48,677	456,605
riighest 1/3	То	32,753	63,517	37,512	32,022	30,870	35,546	29,483
	From	32,752	63,516	37,511	32,021	30,869	35,545	29,482
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	29,658	39,333	32,889	29,791	29,125	29,658	27,819
	To	27,049	36,691	27,997	27,289	25,740	25,913	25,971
Lowest 1/3	From	27,048	36,690	27,996	27,288	25,739	25,912	25,970
Lowest 1/3	To	15,331	23,412	21,401	19,654	17,664	15,331	15,862

12. Instructional Square Feet per Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE

There is a wide range of results here, since school districts outsource parts of this work, and some districts have no one in this category. The range is from 65,283 to 1,090,796 with a median of 181,108 square feet per FTE. Districts in Region 1 reported so few that their results were Not Applicable.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	1,090,796		675,211	476,600	441,369	657,138	1,090,796
riighest 1/5	То	234,142	N/A	149,434	256,201	189,194	255,000	243,216
	From	234,141		149,433	256,200	189,193	254,999	243,215
Mid 1/3	Median 🗳	181,108	N/A	117,907	199,253	141,414	234,142	187,220
	To	133,889		101,486	124,315	116,686	181,108	140,533
Lowest 1/3	From	133,888	N/A	101,485	124,314	116,685	181,107	140,532
LOWEST 1/3	To	65,283		65,283	68,001	66,514	94,662	81,750

Page 20 of 24

13. Instructional Square Feet per Supervisory FTE

The range in	The range in this category is from 151,057 to 1,880,000, with a median of 517,430 square feet per FTE.												
		All Regions	Region 1	Region 2	Region 3	Region 4	Region 5	Region 6					
Highest 1/3	From	1,880,000		1,332,354			1,435,784	1,291,967					
	To From	675,211 675,210	•		•	,	643,089 643,088	743,668 743,667					
Mid 1/3	Median	517,430 404,500	•	*	*	*	468,284 398,253	673,482 608,000					
Lowest 1/3	From To	404,499 151,057	,	294,169	434,749	315,363	398,252 153,307	607,999 316,773					

14. Square Feet per Clerical Secretarial FTE

Again, a wide range of experience. The range is from 315,364 square feet per FTE to 2,628,552 square feet per FTE, with a median of 875,146. Districts in Regions 1 and 2 reported so few in this category that their results were Not Applicable.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	2,628,552			2,609,825	1,895,000	2,628,552	2,263,230
riightost 170	То	1,097,229	N/A	N/A	1,100,896	1,459,418	1,020,000	1,090,796
	From	1,097,228			1,100,895	1,459,417	1,019,999	1,090,795
Mid 1/3	Median 🥏	875,146	N/A	N/A	856,800	875,146	959,000	862,333
	То	654,000			621,573	549,373	763,613	654,000
Lowest 1/3	From	653,999	N/A	N/A	621,572	549,372	763,612	653,999
LOWEST 1/3	To	315,364			404,500	315,364	358,122	422,989

15. Acres per Grounds FTE

The total acres under maintenance was divided by the number of FTEs assigned to "Grounds." Fewer than half of all districts had a separate category for this work, and districts in Region 1 reported so few in this category, the results were Not Applicable. The range was from 10 acres to 390 acres, with a median of 85 acres.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	390		359	275	390	324	200
riighest 1/5	То	117	N/A	90	120	148	143	71
	From	116		89	119	147	142	70
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	85	N/A	80	84	109	116	67
	To	60		50	50	84	84	48
Lowest 1/3	From	59	N/A	49	49	83	83	47
Lowest 1/3	То	10		20	17	10	26	31

Page 21 of 24

16. Total Maintenance Expenditures per Student

The number of students has an impact on maintenance expenditures. Maintenance expenditures were divided by the total number of students. The range of maintenance spending per student was \$426 to \$1,116, with a median of \$637.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 1,116	\$ 698	\$ 1,116	\$ 903	\$ 886	\$ 900	\$ 1,032
riighest 1/5	То	\$ 681	\$ 641	\$ 695	\$ 648	\$ 652	\$ 675	\$ 859
	From	\$ 680	\$ 640	\$ 694	\$ 647	\$ 651	\$ 674	\$ 858
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$ 637	\$ 580	\$ 624	\$ 620	\$ 634	\$ 626	\$ 747
	To	\$ 599	\$ 573	\$ 610	\$ 555	\$ 540	\$ 585	\$ 660
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 598	\$ 572	\$ 609	\$ 554	\$ 539	\$ 584	\$ 659
Lowest 1/3	To	\$ 426	\$ 456	\$ 500	\$ 434	\$ 426	\$ 466	\$ 520

17. Utilities per Square Foot of Instructional Building Space

Although less controllable than labor costs, utilities still represent an opportunity for reducing expenses. Total utilities expenditure ranged from \$.60 per square foot to \$2.25 per square foot, with a median of \$1.38 per square foot.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$ 2.25	\$ 1.71	\$ 1.94	\$ 1.87	\$ 2.18	\$ 1.66	\$ 2.25
riighest 1/3	To	\$ 1.52	\$ 1.58	\$ 1.47	\$ 1.36	\$ 1.55	\$ 1.38	\$ 1.84
	From	\$ 1.51	\$ 1.57	\$ 1.46	\$ 1.35	\$ 1.54	\$ 1.37	\$ 1.83
Mid 1/3	Median 👄	\$ 1.38	\$ 1.32	\$ 1.33	\$ 1.32	\$ 1.44	\$ 1.31	\$ 1.70
	To	\$ 1.30	\$ 1.18	\$ 1.27	\$ 1.23	\$ 1.37	\$ 1.24	\$ 1.53
Lowest 1/3	From	\$ 1.29	\$ 1.17	\$ 1.26	\$ 1.22	\$ 1.36	\$ 1.23	\$ 1.52
LOWEST 1/3	То	\$ 0.60	\$ 0.65	\$ 1.09	\$ 0.97	\$ 0.93	\$ 0.60	\$ 1.09

18. Average Annual Salary of All Building and Grounds FTE

Total salaries paid annually were divided by total FTEs in Building and Grounds. The result for the total, and for the subcategories below, is the average annual salary per FTE. The range is from \$18,585 to \$69,163, with a median of \$36,126.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$69,163	\$36,105	\$47,895	\$69,163	\$48,814	\$49,247	\$59,350
riighest 1/3	To	\$38,449	\$31,910	\$35,798	\$37,866	\$36,744	\$38,000	\$45,724
	From	\$38,448	\$31,909	\$35,797	\$37,865	\$36,743	\$37,999	\$45,723
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$36,126	\$29,989	\$33,394	\$35,945	\$36,060	\$34,134	\$43,365
	To	\$33,444	\$29,790	\$30,478	\$33,322	\$32,371	\$33,518	\$40,259
Lowest 1/3	From	\$33,443	\$29,789	\$30,477	\$33,321	\$32,370	\$33,517	\$40,258
LUWEST 1/3	То	\$18,585	\$18,585	\$25,575	\$23,656	\$25,248	\$30,148	\$30,739

Page 22 of 24

19. Average Annual Salary of Custodial FTE

The range of annual salaries per Custodial FTE is from \$16,150 to \$69,952, with a median of \$34,067 Region Region Region Region Region Region Regions From \$69,952 \$35,705 \$45,932 \$67,480 \$43,801 \$44,353 \$69,952 Highest 1/3 \$36,685 \$30,531 \$32,806 \$35,594 \$34,303 \$35,371 \$43,110 From \$36,684 \$30,530 \$32,805 \$35,593 \$34,302 \$35,370 \$43,109 Mid 1/3 Median 👄 \$34,067 \$27,139 \$30,386 \$33,342 \$31,355 \$32,667 \$41,026 \$32,585 \$29,897 \$37,461 \$31,067 \$27,040 \$27,419 \$31,210 \$31,066 \$27,039 \$27,418 \$32,584 \$29,896 \$31,209 \$37,460 From Lowest 1/3 To \$16,150 \$16,150 \$18,712 \$22,027 \$26,237 \$27,554 \$27,111

20. Average Annual Salary of Skilled Trades/Maintenance FTE

The range in this category is from \$21,390 to \$79,357, with a median of \$40,552. Districts in Region 1 reported so few in this category, the results were Not Applicable.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$79,357		\$52,993	\$79,357	\$52,044	\$64,000	\$71,420
riigiiest 1/3	To	\$42,585	N/A	\$39,655	\$42,850	\$42,044	\$41,829	\$54,081
	From	\$42,584		\$39,654	\$42,849	\$42,043	\$41,828	\$54,080
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$40,552	N/A	\$33,138	\$39,289	\$38,509	\$41,000	\$50,283
	To	\$38,509		\$34,697	\$38,627	\$37,244	\$36,833	\$45,435
Lowest 1/3	From	\$38,508	N/A	\$34,696	\$38,626	\$37,243	\$36,832	\$45,434
Lowest 1/3	To	\$21,390		\$21,994	\$25,783	\$25,158	\$21,390	\$38,116

21. Average Annual Salary of Supervisory FTE

The range in this category is from \$30,974 to \$111,345, with a median of \$63,120.

		AII	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$111,345	\$73,127	\$74,340	\$111,345	\$105,545	\$88,730	\$111,315
Tilgriest 1/5	То	\$70,054	\$48,173	\$62,910	\$69,794	\$63,120	\$63,960	\$87,478
	From	\$70,053	\$48,172	\$62,909	\$69,793	\$63,119	\$63,959	\$87,477
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$63,120	\$39,660	\$51,589	\$60,767	\$57,500	\$57,603	\$77,888
	To	\$53,613	\$38,040	\$50,000	\$54,608	\$52,250	\$48,709	\$69,360
Lowest 1/3	From	\$53,612	\$38,039	\$49,999	\$54,607	\$52,249	\$48,708	\$69,359
Lowest 1/3	То	\$30,974	\$34,668	\$30,974	\$33,000	\$40,435	\$36,024	\$45,000

22. Average Annual Salary of Clerical/Secretarial FTE

The range in this category is from \$14,798 to \$63,040, with a median of \$36,698. Districts in Regions 1 and 2 reported so few in this category that their results were Not Applicable.

		All	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region	Region
		Regions	1	2	3	4	5	6
Highest 1/3	From	\$63,040			\$43,090	\$63,040	\$45,915	\$51,442
riigilest 1/5	То	\$39,036	N/A	N/A	\$38,000	\$32,781	\$40,755	\$43,430
	From	\$69,035			\$37,999	\$32,780	\$40,754	\$43,429
Mid 1/3	Median 🕏	\$36,698	N/A	N/A	\$36,000	\$30,919	\$40,000	\$38,430
	То	\$33,462			\$34,555	\$29,127	\$34,772	\$36,698
Lowest 1/3	From	\$33,461	N/A	N/A	\$34,554	\$29,126	\$34,771	\$36,697
LUWEST 1/3	То	\$14,798			\$14,798	\$22,927	\$29,101	\$25,132

Page 24 of 24